

I Printing the Ties that Bind: Pierre de Changy's
 Translation of the *De institutione feminae*
 Christiana by Juan Luis Vives

ABSTRACT

The 1543 edition which included Pierre de Changy's translation *Institution de la femme chrestienne* offers us a new window onto the ways in which conduct books and texts on household governance were written and circulated in households in the sixteenth century. The edition creates a sense of unity, through references to the Changy family and to male and female domestic roles. Thematic and pedagogical similarities between this collection and fifteenth-century manuscript miscellanies suggest the potential continuity of reading practices within the household even in the middle decades of the sixteenth century. Through print, family documents were commodified and transformed into a widely disseminated handbook on family morality.

The sixteenth century witnessed the flourishing in print of books that described, theorized, and gave guidance on life within the household. Some books were concerned with the practical aspects of household management, which were defined by such activities as cookery, wine or agriculture.¹ Other works were conduct manuals, concerned primarily with the behaviour of household members, especially women and children. For these works the household was a moral entity as much as it was a physical place. The 1543

- I An example of the popularity of the genre of household management in sixteenth-century France is seen in the many editions of the *Agriculture et maison rustique* by Charles Estienne and Jean Liébault, a French translation of the *Predium rusticum* by the same authors. It includes three chapters on the moral characteristics and obligations of farm managers: 'L'Office du pere de famille' (fol. 8 recto), 'L'Office du fermier' (fol. 8 verso), and 'L'Estat de la fermiere' (fol. 8 verso). Charles Estienne and Jean Liébault, *Agriculture et maison rustique* (Paris: Jacques du Puys, 1564; USTC 30233).

Jacques Kerver edition of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, a French translation by Pierre de Changy of the *De institutione feminae Christianae* by Juan Luis Vives, offers us a new window onto the ways in which conduct books and texts on household governance were written and circulated in households in the sixteenth century.² It sought not only to reproduce in print familial relationships, but actively strove to shape the reading practices of households across extended social networks, which, through the circulation of the work in print, would come to encompass the book-reading public in Paris.

The volume attracts our attention nowadays because of the translation of the first, longest and most famous text in the collection, the *De institutione feminae Christianae*. However, it also contained translations from Latin by Pierre de Changy of the *De officio mariti* by Vives, an unattributed French translation of the Pseudo-Bernhardine *Epistola de cura rei familiaris*, together with a treatise on humility composed by Changy himself in the vernacular. The book as a whole is an instance of the very widespread sixteenth-century practice of printing several texts together in a single volume. This resulted in textual groupings marketed primarily under the heading of a single text. Although not self-proclaimed anthologies, these books nevertheless display what we might understand to be ‘anthologising tendencies’.³ They were collections of texts compiled on a common theme, linked to certain historical events or united by a common author. They could have been gathered together because of a – sometimes scarcely perceptible – multi-agency pseudo-editorial imperative whereby texts were selected according to personal literary or cultural tastes.

- 2 Juan Luis Vives, *Livre tres bon plaisant et salutaire de l'institution de la femme chrestienne, tant en son enfance, que mariage et viduite* (Paris: Jacques Fezandat for Jacques Kerver, 1543; USTC 27254). All references are to this edition unless otherwise stated.
- 3 Writing on Changy's methodology more generally, Jean Vignes has commented: ‘en l'absence d'une poétique cohérente en matière de traduction, on doit toutefois s'interroger sur la démarche anthologique de Changy et sur l'interprétation à donner à certaines modifications infligées au texte’. ‘En attendant du Pinet: Pierre de Changy et son *Sommaire des singularitez de Plinē*’, in *Esculape et Dionysos: Mélanges en l'honneur de Jean Céard*, ed. Jean Dupèbe and others (Geneva: Droz, 2008), pp. 459–70, p. 466.

This essay explores the links between the different texts in the 1543 Kerver edition of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*. It analyses the ways in which references to the Changy family and the notion of the household as a site of moral development create a sense of unity in the volume where the individual texts and the reading guidance given by the prefaces may otherwise appear to be only superficially linked. The volume as a whole includes texts which explore both female and male roles within the domestic realm, translations and original works, dedicatory epistles addressed to both male and female recipients, texts by living authors as well as medieval works, short as well as long texts. In studying the ways in which the volume was brought together, this essay will also trace the movements of texts as they cross the borders that separate Latin from the vernacular languages, manuscript transmission from print circulation and private family reading from more widespread dissemination amongst a general reading public.

Educating the Family in the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*

The primary reason for the publication of the first edition of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* in 1542 was to make French translations of the *De institutione feminae Christianae* and the *De officio mariti* available for the first time.⁴ This new accessibility to the reading public literate either solely or more fluently in the vernacular was an important milestone in the dissemination of the texts because, unusually for works composed by such a prominent humanist educator, they both circulated more widely in translation than in the original Latin.⁵ The *De institutione feminae Christianae*

4 Juan Luis Vives, *Livre de l'institution de la femme chrestienne* (Paris: Jacques Kerver, 1542; USTC 40209). See the publication history of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* presented by Vignes, 'En Attendant du Pinet', p. 462.

5 Enrique González González, 'Fame and Oblivion', trans. Charles Fantazzi in *Brill's Companions to the Christian Tradition: A Companion to Juan Luis Vives*, ed. Charles Fantazzi (Leiden: Brill, 2008), pp. 359–413, pp. 365–6.

was translated into no fewer than eight vernacular languages in total and travelled as far as New Mexico.⁶ This widespread dissemination of the work is a reflection of the level of innovation the work offered to the reader in proposing in print a comprehensive guide to moral living for women from the earliest days of girlhood to widowhood and old age. Furthermore, Vives's own erudition must have contributed to the intellectual and moral interest of the text on a subject which so few authors had treated at such length and in such detail.⁷ The fact that the *De institutione feminae Christianae* and the *De officio mariti* had been available in translation in English and Castilian for over a decade suggests that the print publication of Changy's translations would have met with an air of expectation from the French-language readership.

The printing of a second edition of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* in 1543 by Michel Fezandat for Jacques Kerver included not just this text and a translation of the *De officio mariti*, but also two other texts that had a significance within the Changy family. This 1543 edition and three subsequent impressions where these texts are also included on the title page stand out because they deepen our understanding of the types of vernacular texts that were composed, circulated and read in the early modern household.⁸ Other sixteenth-century editions of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* have the clear rationale of presenting the Vives works

6 The *De institutione feminae Christianae* was translated into Castilian (1528), English (1528), French (1542), German (1544), Italian (1546), Dutch (1554). For full details of these works and an account of the wider influence of the work see Juan Luis Vives, *The Education of a Christian Woman*, ed. and trans. Charles Fantazzi (Chicago and London: Chicago University Press, 2000), pp. 30–5. The *De institutione feminae Christianae* was especially influential in the work of the seventeenth-century Mexican nun Sor Juana de la Cruz. See, for example, Elizabeth Teresa Howe, 'Sor Juana Ines de la Cruz and Juan Luis Vives', *Discurso*, 11 (1993), 63–72.

7 As Charles Fantazzi has noted: 'Vives compiled the most systematic treatise on the education of women of all the various essays on the status of women in the Renaissance. His influence on this subject, both in England and Europe, was incalculable'. Juan Luis Vives, *De institutione feminae Christianae: liber primus*, ed. Charles Fantazzi and Constantinus Matheussen; trans. C. Fantazzi (Leiden: Brill, 1996), xxvi.

8 These are USTC 40487, USTC 63558 and USTC 14864.

to a vernacular reading public.⁹ Whilst they also include liminary poetry in Latin and French by Blaise de Changy and his friends and epistles from Pierre de Changy and his son Jacques to Pierre's daughters Marguerite and Madamoyselle de Villesablon, these books relied for their success on the renown of the humanist scholar who had composed the two principal texts in Latin. However, the 1543 Kerver edition presents a broader range of educational and household texts. As well as specifying the coverage of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* ('tant en son enfance, que mariage et viduite' [in her childhood, marriage and widowhood]), all three of the other works in the volume are inventorized on the title page and the idea of 'nouveau' plays a prominent role. The *Office du mary* is said to have been 'nouvellement traduitz en langue francoyse par Pierre de Changy escuyer' [newly translated into French by Pierre de Changy, Esquire]. A treatise on humility, an original work by Changy himself, has been 'adjoustee de nouveau' [newly added] together with an unattributed French translation of the Pseudo-Bernhardine *Epistola de cura rei familiaris*.¹⁰ This is the innovation relative to the 1542 edition of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*. Finally, the works are described as 'reueu et corrige oultre les precedentes impressions' [revised and corrected since previous printings].

In positioning itself as a book which sought to fulfil the educational needs of the family as a whole, the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* may have adopted a formula that had already been developed in relation to the original Latin works written by Vives. As González González has asserted:

- 9 These are: USTC 40489, USTC 49488, USTC 76649, USTC 9767, USTC 41282, USTC 40600, USTC 62158 and USTC 993. There are also four impressions listed in the USTC which have no surviving copies. These are USTC 40657, USTC 40488, USTC 40730 and USTC 62179.
- 10 The translation of the *Epistola de cura rei familiaris* is attributed to Bernard de Clairvaux, although this attribution is now widely regarded as insecure. As Mark Kauntze has explained: 'the problem is that Bernard's name came to carry a certain authority among later generations, and all the other treatises ascribed to him in manuscripts [except the *Cosmographia*] are to varying degrees dubious'. *Authority and Imitation: A Study of the 'Cosmographia' of Bernard Silvestris* (Leiden: Brill, 2014), p. 26.

In 1538, from Basel Thomas Winter disseminated the Latin text of both treatises [the *De institutione feminae Christianae* and the *De officio mariti*], revised by the author, throughout Europe, at first each separately, but already in 1540 and again around 1541 both treatises in a single volume, with the addition of two letters for the instruction of young boys and girls, which gave the ensemble the tone of a handbook for the education of the whole family.¹¹

Although no direct link can be proven between the Winter editions and the compilation of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, a number of similarities can be observed between the two works. This is most obviously true in the selection of the *De institutione feminae Christianae* and the *De officio mariti* as texts that accompany each other, a choice made by Blaise de Changy, Pierre's son. It would seem an obvious but worthwhile point to make that this mirrors the state of matrimonial harmony promoted by the texts themselves. In the volume they are companion texts as husband and wife are throughout life. The Changy volume shares with the Winter editions the inclusion of epistles and dedications which seek to further the book's educational aims. Above all, the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* has in common with the Winter editions the suitability of its constituent elements for the whole family. Changy's evaluation of the *De institutione feminae Christianae* as 'bon et utile pour livre domestique' can equally be applied to the other parts of the volume.¹²

The prefaces to the translations of the *De institutione feminae Christianae* and the *De officio mariti* further emphasize the links between the different members of the Changy family. They are dedicated by Pierre to his children Marguerite and Blaise. These dedications by Pierre to his children are a distinctive and unifying aspect of the volume. So often in sixteenth-century print culture the dedicatee of a book was a potential patron or prestigious 'ideal reader' whose virtues were said to be reflected in the work at hand. This had been the case with the original Latin edition of the *De*

11 González González, 'Fame and Oblivion', p. 365.

12 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, A5 verso. On this point see Pollie Bromilow, 'An Emerging Female Readership of Print in Sixteenth-Century France? Pierre de Changy's Translation of the *De institutione feminae Christianae* by Juan Luis Vives', *French Studies* 67 (2013), 155–70, p. 163.

institutione femine Christianae, which was printed in Antwerp in 1524. It was dedicated to Catherine of Aragon and the dedication to her was translated by Changy and included in the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* and preceded the epistle he had written to his daughter, who is referred to simply as 'Marguerite'. The fact of a father from outside the court or nobility dedicating the text to his daughter can be considered exceptional in the 1540s. It can be contextualized by Jessica Murphy's remark on women's conduct manuals in the English language that they 'are often dedicated either to the young women whom they will benefit or to patronesses who stand as great examples of behaviour'.¹³ The title of the epistle 'A Marguerite ma fille' ['To Marguerite my daughter'] emphasizes the importance of the father-daughter relationship over any markers of social standing. This dedication to a family member is different even from Pierre de Changy's other translation which was also published posthumously and dedicated by his son Blaise to the Bishop of Orléans.¹⁴

In the dedication, Changy alludes to women's lack of knowledge of the Latin language as one of his primary motivations for translating the work:

Car je trouvoys indecent telz et si bons enseignemens pour Filles, Femmes et Vesves y
contenus leur estre occultes et mussez par tel et si hault latin a elles non entendibles.

[Because I found it inconvenient that such and so good teachings for girls, wives
and widows found within were obscured and muted by such and so high Latin not
understandable to them.]¹⁵

Although the circumstances of composition of texts were commonly included in prefaces in the sixteenth century, this revelation by Pierre de Changy is a key way in which he performs his paternal role in print. The

13 Jessica C. Murphy, *Virtuous Necessity: Conduct Literature and the Making of the Virtuous Woman in Early Modern England* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2015), p. 3.

14 *Sommaire des Singularitez de Plinie, extrait des seize premiers livres de sa naturelle histoire, et mis en vulgaire Francoys par Pierre de Changy, escuyer* (Paris: Arnoul and Charles Angelier, 1542; USTC 88999 and 40305). For a study of this text see Vignes, 'En attendant du Pinet'.

15 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, A5 verso. All translations are my own.

primary emotion expressed in the dedication is one of care: care for his daughter and care for women readers more generally. As such, Changy's volume comes to represent qualities of fatherhood which combined affection and authority that Philip Grace has explained thus:

It is not that fathers were either figures of vertical, hierarchical authority or horizontal bonds of affection: it was that they exemplified *diagonal* bonds; they combined the power to enforce order with tenderness toward their charges. The richness of the connection between different roles gave fatherhood its significance both in everyday experience and as a metaphor used in a variety of contexts.¹⁶

The fact of undertaking the translation is an example of vertical authority in action. Pierre de Changy uses his linguistic knowledge to provide a text infused with his fatherly ability to guide and advise. Yet, his anticipation of high levels of reader engagement suggests that this text will be one which supports the reader's own learning as well as imposing behavioural models from above. As such it demonstrates the diagonal dynamic which Grace contends was so strongly associated with models of fatherhood.

This diagonal role of the father as mixing hierarchical power and horizontal care is also demonstrated when Pierre recounts how both of the original Latin texts have been passed to him by his sons, Blaise and Jacques. In the preface to the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, Pierre tells his daughter Marguerite that the text came to be in his possession 'de la librairie du seigneur saint Anthot conseiller en nostre souveraine court à Digeon ton frere maistre Jacques docteur es droictz ma apporte à Changy ung livre en latin' [from the library of Lord Saint Anthot councillor in our sovereign court in Dijon your brother Master Jacques Doctor in Law brought to me in Changy a Latin book]. By detailing the journey of the volume from the library of a legal officeholder in the Court in Dijon to the village in Changy, Pierre is inscribing the translation in the literary and social networks of the Changy family. He is also presenting the book not only as the product of his own concern for his children, but as the result of the care and affection that his offspring show each other.

16 Philip Grace, *Affectionate Authorities: Fathers and Fatherly Roles in Late Medieval Basel* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2015), p. 9.

The epistle prefacing the *Office du mary* also explains the physical journey taken by the book. The letter starts with the address ‘A Blaise de Changy mon filz, estudiant a Paris’ [To Blaise de Changy my son, student in Paris].¹⁷ It is interesting to note the ways in which Changy addresses his daughter Marguerite and his son Blaise differently. We are told that Blaise is a student in Paris and he is also referred to by his family name as well as his first name. Marguerite, on the other hand, is referred to as Changy’s daughter. She is given no geographical location and only her first name is given. Marguerite is also addressed in the ‘tu’ form, whereas Blaise is consistently addressed using ‘vous’. These differences might reflect a difference in forms of address for family members residing in or outside the household. In the letter, Pierre de Changy describes the way in which Blaise sent him the original Latin text to translate from Paris:

Monsieur le cure d’Espoisses, apres avoir traduit en langue maternelle le livre dessus escript, de l’institution de la femme chrestienne, vous m’avez envoye de Paris, le livre de l’office du mary, compose par le mesme aucteur en plus profonde matiere, pour le joindre avec le precedent: mais icelluy avez requis estre mis en Francois.

[The curate of Espoisses, having translated into the mother tongue the book written above on the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, you sent to me from Paris the book of the *Office du mary* written by the same author in greater depth to add it to the preceding text: but this one you requested be rendered into French.]¹⁸



Again, Blaise is given an occupation, this time as a curate rather than a student. Both descriptions give him authority as a compiler of educational texts. Here we learn that the translation of the *De officio mariti* was a commission from Blaise which he intended to put together with the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*. This dedication reveals the role Blaise played in shaping the contents of the volume as well as in preparing it for publication. A further comment by Changy seems to suggest that the translation of the *De officio mariti* was not a task that he felt the same depth of motivation for as his rendering of the *De institutione feminae Christianae*: ‘Jay pris le plus

17 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, P1 recto.

18 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, P1 recto.

commun, empesche de viellesse, et maladie selon mon petit entendement' [I took the most simple [points] prevented by old age and illness according to my little understanding].¹⁹

The fourth text in the volume is also dedicated to a member of the Changy family. The *Briefve instruction* is the only original piece described on the title page to be included in the volume. In the 1543 Jacques Kerver edition, this treatise has two recipients. It is prefaced by an epistle from Jacques de Changy to his sister, Madamoyselle de Villesablon and later presented more simply by Pierre de Changy to his daughter Francoyse who was a nun in the convent of St Claire at Bourges.²⁰ Whereas previous prefaces have revealed the dynamics apparent in the relationships between Pierre de Changy and his daughters, this preface by Jacques, his only written contribution to the volume, demonstrates that moral and educational aspirations were intra-generational. There are few traces of Madamoyselle de Villesablon's life in this prayer, which is several pages long and concludes, as does the instruction it prefaces, with the word 'amen'. From the recipient's unmarried status and the wide variety of virtues and vices evoked by the prayer, we can assume that the epistle addresses the perceived devotional needs of a young woman as she journeys through life. As well as virtues commonly praised in women in the practice of their everyday lives such as chastity, the epistle focuses on the woman's interior life and her relationship to God:

Soyez poure en esperit, simple et debonnaire, ayez desir de justice, plorez tous pechez, soyez misericordieuse, et nourrissez paix, souffrez persecution justement, esjouyssez vous si l'on vous blasme, gardez vous d'ingratitude, recongnoissez les benefices de Dieu, fuyez parolles oyseuses et noyseuses, n'escoutez point flateurs ...

[Be poor in spirit, simple and mild, desire justice, lament all sins, be merciful and nourish peace, accept persecution justly, rejoice if you are reproached, keep yourself from ingratitude, recognise God's favours, flee idle and damaging words and don't listen to flattery ...]²¹

19 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, P1 recto.

20 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, S5 verso.

21 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, S6 recto.

What this preface shows us is that Jacques saw himself as Madamoyselle de Villesablon's educator and instructor, a position legitimized in the text by the emphasis on the offices he held in the epistle's title: 'Escuyer, Docteur es droictz, Advocat a Dijon'.²² We can read this epistle as a textual echo of the instruction penned by Pierre and in that sense it fulfils some of the conventional expectations of the preface, such as training the reader on how to read the text, although this guidance for the reader is not made explicit. Even the description of Jacques as an 'escuyer' repeats the description on the title page of the volume of the translator as 'Pierre de Changy, escuyer'. The inclusion of the epistle by Jacques reveals that the book was likely put together by the Changy family over a period of time. It may have been commissioned precisely because the *Briefve instruction* did not have a preface and one was considered necessary for the work to appear in print. Pierre's death before the volume appeared in print presented the impossibility of an epistle by him being added at this later stage. Jacques's authorship of the epistle demonstrates that the compilation of the book was very much a collaborative family project founded on shared moral values and common textual interests.

The *Briefve instruction* is described simply as 'envoyee par ledict [Pierre] de Changy. A seur Francoyse de Changy sa fille Religieuse a sainte Claire de Bourges' [Brief instruction sent by the aforementioned de Changy to sister Francoyse de Changy his daughter Nun at Saint Claire de Bourges].²³ However, evidence from the text itself suggests that this was a meditation that was composed specifically for her use. The subject matter is wholly appropriate for her religious vocation. In addition, the use of 'briefve' in the text's title echoes both the more limited educational aspirations for women.²⁴

22 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, S5 verso.

23 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, S7 recto.

24 According to Vives: 'Ad hoc, ut virorum numerosæ sint, feminarum certe mores paucissimus formari præceptis possunt. Quoniam viri et domi et foris et in re publica versantur; ideo quæ ratio sit tantæ diversitatis officiorum non nisi longis voluminibus explicatur' [In addition, although rules of conduct for men are numerous, the moral formation of women can be parted with very few precepts, since men are occupied

It is interesting to note that Changy chose to compose a separate work for his daughter who had taken holy orders rather than, for example, dedicating the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* to his daughters jointly or indeed to Francoyse alone. González González has pointed out that the Vives text differed from its medieval predecessors by not according a place to convent life but rather conceiving of women's education taking place within the family home:

Medieval writers on the education of women, like Francesc Eiximenis, spoke about the young unmarried girl, the married woman, the widow and the nun. Vives passed over the last option in silence, since he assigned a completely secular role to women, in the bosom of the family, with no option for the convent.²⁵

By composing a text for his daughter which emphasized her location behind convent walls, Changy was certainly reflecting the configuration of his own family, but he may also have been attempting to repair the lacuna in the Vives text.

The final lines of the treatise convey the sense that this devotional and educational text is also a personal act of commemoration: 'Dieu vous doint grace le suyvre en tel estime que vostre feu mere, laquelle je vous pryé ne mettre en obly en voz oraisons quotidiennes. Amen'. [God give you the grace to follow him in the same esteem as your late mother, whom I would ask you never to forget in your daily prayers. Amen.]²⁶ This phrase acts as a multiple commemoration of Changy family members. Firstly, Pierre entreates his daughter to follow the example of her late mother in worshipping God. Secondly, he asks her to remember her mother in her daily prayers. Finally, given that the volume as a whole was printed after his death, the treatise acts as a memorial to the love, care and moral guidance that he extended to his daughter during his lifetime. A similar tone

both within the house and outside it, in public and in private, and for that reason it requires lengthy volumes to explain the norms to be observed in such varied duties]. Vives, *De institutione femine Christianae*, §3.

25 González González, 'Fame and Oblivion', p. 365.

26 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, T6 verso.

is struck in his epistle to Marguerite when he foresees how the text he has translated will be useful to her throughout her life:

Esperant que par la recordation des enseignemens d'icelluy, tu augmenteras ta vertu et renom, tant en l'aage nubile auquel tu es de praesent que en autre estat quant tu y parviendras, et qu'il sera besoing d'enseigner les autres, si tu en as charge.

[Hoping that in remembering the teachings in this [book], you will develop your virtue and reputation, as much as in the young age that you are in now as in any other state that you arrive in and if you need to teach others if you have charge of them.]²⁷

Here Pierre's aspirations for Marguerite extend beyond her own education to include the possibility that she will one day be responsible for the moral development of others, either her own children or possibly servants.²⁸ In this way, Marguerite comes to represent a universal female reader who will find the book of value and interest irrespective of her age or marital status.

Read together, the prefaces of the 1543 Kerver edition of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* demonstrate the role that Changy saw for his translations in furthering the moral and educational aspirations for his children, especially his daughters, at a time when no other works by living authors addressed these topics so comprehensively in the vernacular. Furthermore, they illuminate the ways in which the anthology of educational texts he collected together acted as a memorial of his life and pedagogical influence over his family after his death.

27 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, A5 verso.

28 Conduct literature for women frequently alludes to what Murphy has called the 'transformative power of feminine virtue', that is, the ability of women to educate those in their social networks. *Virtuous Necessity*, p. 34. For a discussion of this in English-language conduct literature see Murphy, *Virtuous Necessity*, esp. Chapter 2: "'Honest Government': Feminine Virtue's Network of Influence in Early Modern England'.

The *Institution de la femme chrestienne* from Manuscript to Print

Thus far we have seen the manner in which the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* offers us an insight into the ways that texts were circulated and read by a family from the administrative classes. In their translation from Latin to the vernacular, these texts made journeys from the capital to the provinces, from urban Dijon to rural Changy, from the library of a legal officeholder into the hands of a young female reader and her female entourage and from secular society to the cloisters beyond convent walls. One final way in which these texts travelled is on their transformative journey from manuscript to print.

The links between the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* and manuscript culture can be explored through the inclusion of the third text, an unattributed French translation of the Pseudo-Bernhardine *Epistola de cura rei familiaris*. According to Mark Kauntze it was the work most frequently attributed to 'Bernard':

The *Epistola de cura rei familiaris* [...] survives in hundreds of manuscripts, including vernacular translations. The letter is addressed from a certain 'Bernardus', and later copyists often took this to be Bernard Silvestris (perhaps because he was a known authority on the *ars dictaminis*) or else Bernard of Clairvaux.²⁹

The translation is presumed to be by Changy himself, although it is not attributed to him in the paratexts. According to Paul Chavy, the inclusion of the *Epistola de cura rei familiaris* in the volume with the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* was the first time that a translation of the text had been printed in the sixteenth century.³⁰ The previous printed translation dated

29 Kauntze, *Authority and Imitation*, p. 26.

30 Paul Chavy, *Traducteurs d'autrefois, Moyen Age et Renaissance: Dictionnaire des traducteurs et de la littérature traduite en ancien et moyen français, 842-1600*, ed. Paul Chavy, 2 vols (Paris and Geneva: Champion and Slatkine, 1988), I, 172-8; 334.

from 1487.³¹ Chavy notes that many more texts attributed to Bernard of Clairvaux are found in manuscripts than printed books of the period.³² It is therefore interesting to consider why it was considered an appropriate text to include in the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*. In what ways was this thirteenth-century text that spoke to the medieval and manuscript traditions considered a textual companion in a printed book which contained two translations of leading humanist treatises and an original composition by the translator? The *Epistola de cura rei familiaris* was one of the most famous short texts on household management in medieval France. It was not only suitable for inclusion in a 'livre domestique' for this reason, but also because, having circulated so widely in manuscript miscellanies of the period, the text would likely still have been found in many sixteenth-century households. It is interesting to note that, unlike the other two texts that he has translated, Changy does not give an explanation of how the epistle came into his possession.

An example of how the vernacular translation of the *Epistola de cura rei familiaris* circulated alongside other texts of pedagogical value in the fifteenth century can be found in Paris, BnF fr. 1551. The manuscript contains fourteen main items, the last three of which appear to have been added by a later hand. Included in the book are a number of devotional or pedagogical pieces by well-known authors including the *Testament* and *Petit Codicille* attributed to Jean de Meun, Christine de Pizan's *Enseignements moraux*, Jean Lefèvre de Ressons's translation of the *Catonis disticha*, *La Somme le Roi* by Laurent d'Orléans and the *Ordonnances et commandements* of Enguerran de Monstrelet as well as Jean Gerson's *A B C des simples gens*, *Science de bien mourir* and *Instruction pour la confession*.

Karen Fresco's study of this manuscript places it within a tradition of 'catechetical and penitential literature being circulated in the vernacular languages to the lay public'.³³ Her essay does not include analysis of the

31 The earliest surviving edition is listed in USTC as *Le Regime de menage* (Besançon: [Petrus Metlinger, 1487]; USTC 70891).

32 Chavy, *Traducteurs d'autrefois*, I, 172.

33 Karen Fresco 'Christine de Pizan's *Enseignements moraux* in the Order of Texts of Paris, BnF fr. 1551', in *Christine de Pizan: Une femme de science, Une femme de lettres*.

Pseudo-Bernhardine epistle. Here, as in the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, it would seem to be a minor text included alongside much more famous companions towards the end of the volume. However, the miscellany does share some important characteristics with the Changy volume. One of the most significant aspects would seem to be the way in which Paris, BnF fr. 1551 foregrounds the role of women. Gerson's texts 'include a systematic address to both men and women'.³⁴ Furthermore, Christine de Pizan's *Enseignements moraux* represent Christine as a mother giving advice to her son. We can see an obvious parallel between this construction of mother as advisor and the paternal role played by Changy in the prefaces and translations of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*.

Other studies of household, devotional and pedagogical manuscript miscellanies in the fifteenth century display even more similarities between these pre-existing modes of textual transmission and the printed *Institution de la femme chrestienne*. Amanda Moss's study of a household manuscript miscellany produced in fifteenth-century London has revealed certain key features of these works that we can also discern in Changy's volume.³⁵ According to Moss, MS Westminster 3, a miscellany of eighteen devotional and conduct texts, was 'in keeping with the fashion for devotional miscellanies and common-profit books circulating among London merchant families from the early fifteenth century onwards'.³⁶ Similar to Changy's aspiration to educate Marguerite's extended family network through his translation of the *De institutione feminae Christianae*, these manuscript miscellanies responded to a perceived civic responsibility to educate. This involved commissioning manuscript copies of key texts and also specifying how they should be circulated.³⁷ As Moss has said, by so doing,

Études reunies par Juliette Dor et Marie-Elisabeth Henneau avec la collaboration de Bernard Ribemont (Paris: Champion, 2008), pp. 289–303, p. 290.

34 Fresco, 'Christine de Pizan', p. 296.

35 Amanda Moss, 'A Merchant's Tales: A London Fifteenth-Century Household Miscellany', *The Yearbook of English Studies*, 33 (2003), 156–69.

36 Moss, 'A Merchant's Tales', p. 158.

37 Moss cites the example of Cambridge University Library Ff.6.31, financed by the estate of John Colop with the instruction that it be circulated from reader to reader whether male or female for the entire life of the book. Moss, 'A Merchant's Tales', p. 158.

London merchants were not only contributing to the charitable provision of books for poorer lay people, but also ensuring the dissemination of instructional texts that upheld their own ideals, reinforcing their view of the proper order of urban medieval society.³⁸

We can see the same civic aspirations in the uses that Changy foresees for his texts amongst a readership that extends beyond his own immediate family. In the dedication to Marguerite, for example, he writes how he has translated the *De institutione feminae Christianae* into French 'pour ton instruction, et [la] lecture de noz parentes' [for your education and for our female relatives to read].³⁹ The use of 'parentes' as opposed to 'parents' shows that he has a particular female readership in mind for his translation. This reference to a readership beyond his offspring may also be an allusive way of indicating his anticipation and approval of the work's circulation in print. It is worth reflecting here on how the prefaces to the texts in the book have presented the Changy family's role in the community. By emphasizing the occupations of Pierre, Blaise and Jacques we come to view them as highly literate and professionally and socially active in the urban and intellectual centres of Dijon and Paris. Through the descriptions of the genesis of the translations in the prefaces to the texts we also come to consider Pierre, Blaise and Jacques as exemplary citizens who work together for the common purpose of bringing Latin texts to a vernacular-reading public.

The London merchant miscellanies also share with the texts in the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* their status as memorials. Moss states that the common-profit books were funded by testamentary charity and 'usually contained inscriptions urging the recipient to pray for the soul of their benefactor'.⁴⁰ We have seen in Changy's dedication to his daughter in the convent at St Bourges that the idea of the memorial is also strongly present in the *Institution de la femme chrestienne*. In addition, the fact that Pierre de Changy died before the appearance of the first printed edition

38 Moss, 'A Merchant's Tales', p. 158.

39 *Institution de la femme chrestienne*, A5 recto.

40 Moss, 'A Merchant's Tales', p. 159.

of the texts means that the book as a whole can be considered to be a kind of memorial to his life and scholarship.

In the transition from manuscript to print, the volume assumed a different role for the reader. No longer the private property of this family and their network of friends the book would have been bought by readers in Paris for whom the Changy family would have assumed a symbolic function. For this readership, the book would not have had the value of the commemorative legacy that the texts had for the Changy children. The inscriptions from Pierre de Changy to his children were not infused with the poignancy of a private commemorative act. However, the story told by the prefatory materials and the additional texts in the 1543 Kerver edition had enough of a purpose to justify their repeated inclusion with the texts in at least three subsequent editions.

The continued interest in the prefaces and texts which foreground the participation of the Changy family and their reading practices allows us to speculate about the value that the sixteenth-century reader of print may have placed on them. Some of this importance was almost certainly derived simply from the complementarity of the family-oriented prefaces and the domestic nature of the texts that they accompanied. As Grace noted in his study of late medieval Basel, fathers were considered to set a moral example for their household and this was even more the case for fathers who lived with their children:

The everyday intimacy of fathers who lived with their children meant that the example that they provided exerted even more influence than their words of advice, whether this example was good or bad, whether this it was in accordance with the agendas of other authorities or not. This explains the eagerness of civic authorities and religious reformers to appropriate fathers, but it was not a question of investing fathers with moral authority; rather, fathers, inevitably were the main mechanism by which any possible social program would be accomplished.⁴¹

The application of fatherly authority in the practice of daily virtue in the prefaces and translations of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* would therefore have been a noteworthy feature for the contemporary

41 Grace, *Affectionate Authorities*, p. 134.

reader. What greater recommendation could there have been for the texts than the fact that Pierre de Changy had considered them appropriate for his own children? His dedications of the texts to his daughters resonate with the pedagogical aspirations of many male book purchasers incentivized to buy the book and in turn offer it as a gift to a female relative. Thus, the authority of the father-daughter educational relationship may have acquired a commercial function once the book entered print circulation.

Conclusion

Although they were not necessarily framed by an overarching editorial narrative which sought to position the individual texts in relation to each other, textual groupings such as the one in the 1543 Kerver edition of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* provide for us a window onto a world of textual activity amongst people of professional status in sixteenth-century France. Through it, we can trace practices of translation, textual composition, manuscript circulation, borrowing of printed books and textual legacies within a family from the administrative classes that would otherwise be inaccessible to us. We can also understand better the associations that lay readers may have made between texts which otherwise appear to have quite disparate characteristics. This is the case, for example, with the Pseudo-Bernhardine epistle which had not recently been circulated in print. We can speculate on the reasons why the Changy family may have considered it appropriate for inclusion in a volume that reflected so strongly on their own family textual culture. Perhaps the fact that we do not learn where the text comes from indicates that a copy of it was to be found in a manuscript miscellany in the Changy household itself? Alternatively, it may have offered thematic unity to a household book.

The Pseudo-Bernhardine epistle also causes us to ponder on the pivotal role of print in the dissemination of ideas. At this moment when humanist ideas were being propagated by scholars such as Vives, texts such as this one

seem to have found a new relevance in the sixteenth-century world of print. This shows us that reading in print may be more closely modelled on pre-existing manuscript reading practices than consideration of print material alone might suggest. The thematic and pedagogical similarities between the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* and fifteenth-century manuscript miscellanies, such as the foregrounding of the role of women, the importance of the inter-generational textual address and the idea of the book as memorial further emphasize the potential continuity of reading practices within the household even in the middle decades of the sixteenth century.

Pierre de Changy modelled through his composition and translation of texts for his children the qualities of fatherly care which created moral order and harmony within the patriarchal household. His textual activities acquired a moral character because of the way in which they exemplified the father-child relationship that was the cornerstone of society in pre-modern patriarchal world. This example of male care was one that was furthered by his sons Blaise and Jacques even during the creation of the book in their composition and sourcing of texts which furthered the moral education of their female siblings. In addition, the memorial qualities of the book heightened the sense of Changy as a model parent who sought to care for the moral and educational needs of his children from beyond the grave. When the book circulated in print these behavioural paradigms of family morality became not only textualized but also commodified. The role of the father as enduring educator and guide took on a more generalized function for readers who had not been personally acquainted with Changy during his lifetime.

The Changy family sought to meet the needs of communities of readers both within rural Burgundy and more widely amongst the readerships of the Paris printing houses where the 1543 edition and subsequent editions were produced. Pierre de Changy saw the interest in his renderings for friends and relatives as well as Burgundian vignerons more generally and his projects of bringing his translations to a wider reading public were completed by his son Blaise after his death.⁴² Pierre's efforts at translation, as

42 Vignes highlights the way in which Changy addresses the Burgundian vignerons, justifying including only half of Book XVI in the *Sommaire des singularitez de Plinie*

Vignes has noted, are somewhat haphazard and mediocre.⁴³ Many passages are significantly abridged and at times it becomes impossible to locate the source text in the translation. However, his translations of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* and the *Office du mary* were superseded as the prominent French-language translations of the Vives source texts only in 1579 when Christopher Plantin printed a new translation by Antoine Tiron.

Numerous factors could account for the success of the 1543 edition of the *Institution de la femme chrestienne* and those that followed it. The dedication of its constituent parts to the different members of the Changy family and the inclusion of the two shorter texts enabled offered potential readers a more convenient way of taking part in the culture of household books than commissioning their own translations or composing their own texts in manuscript miscellanies. In the book they would find moral guidance for women from childhood to widowhood, instructions on husbandly duties, advice on running a household and contemplations on humility. Through print, the once exclusive documents that attested to Changy's care for his children were transformed into an influential and widely disseminated handbook on family morality. The textual, emotional, and pedagogical ties that bound the generations of the Changy family together were also commodified for consumption by the reading public.

by stating that the excluded pages: 'sert plus à la science des medecins, que à nous' [serve more the learning of doctors than ours]. Pliny, *Sommaire des Singularitez de Pline*, fol. Lxxi. Quoted in Vignes 'En attendant du Pinet', p. 465.

43 Vignes, 'En attendant du Pinet', pp. 465–6.

